

Llywodraeth Cymru Ty'r Afon Heol Bedwas Caerffili CF83 8WT 03000 256 000 Welsh Government Ty'r Afon Bedwas Road Caerphilly CF83 8WT 03000 256 000

cadw.gov.wales

cadw.llyw.cymru

Mr Stephen CD Carter Llandovery Town Council Adelaide House SA20 0YH Eich cyfeirnod Your reference CM015

Ein cyfeirnod Our reference DH

Dyddiad Date 17 March 2023

Llinell uniongyrchol Direct line

0300 0256004

Ebost Email: scheduledmonuments@gov.wales

Dear Mr Carter,

ANCIENT MONUMENTS AND ARCHAEOLOGICAL AREAS ACT 1979 APPLICATION FOR SCHEDULED MONUMENT CONSENT LLANDOVERY CASTLE (CM015)

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Thank you for your application of 27 January 2023 to Cadw for scheduled monument consent to for floating steps, three new plastic benches and two interpretation panels at the above scheduled monument.
- 1.2 Cadw is a Department within the Welsh Government that undertakes the statutory functions of the Welsh Ministers in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.
- 1.3 Each application for scheduled monument consent is considered on its own merits in accordance with *Conservation Principles for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment in Wales* (Conservation Principles) and Annex A of *Technical Advice Note 24: The Historic Environment* (TAN 24). In particular, TAN 24 explains that the main purpose of scheduling is to ensure the preservation of ancient monuments and, when considering an application for scheduled monument consent, there is a presumption against proposals which would involve significant alteration or cause damage or which would have a significant impact on the setting of remains.

2 Assessment

2.1. Your application and supporting documentation has been assessed by our Regional Inspector of Ancient Monuments who has recommended that conditional scheduled monument consent should be approved for(i) installation of new access steps from the bailey to the top of the motte, (ii) 3 number plastic benches to be installed on existing concrete bases, (iii) the removal of material previously eroded from an unauthorised route to the top of the motte, (iv) 2 no new interpretation panels to be installed on new 100mm deep x 900mm long x 800mm wide concrete bases (1 panel on the top of the motte and 1 panel on the NW edge of the site at car park level), and (v) limited ground investigation for potential future installation of handrail, including



excavation of 6 no trial holes and drilling into bedrock. The reasons for the Inspector's conclusions are set out in **Annex A** of this letter.

2.2. I have carefully considered the impact of the proposed development on the scheduled monument and its setting in light of the advice that I have received from our Regional Inspector of Ancient Monuments. I have no reason to disagree with the advice of our Regional Inspector and am satisfied that his recommendation is consistent with the objectives of Conservation Principles and TAN 24.

3. Decision

- 3.1. Accordingly, I hereby approve conditional scheduled monument consent for the proposed works as outlined in section 1.1.
- 3.2. In reaching this decision, I have taken into account the requirement of sections 3 and 5 of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act. I consider that this decision is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Ministers' well-being objective of A Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh Language.
- 3.3. Any development control issues associated with wider development will be a matter for any application for planning permission. It is the responsibility of the applicant to establish whether any further approval or consents are required for the proposed development.

4. Proposed Conditions

- 4.1. The following proposed conditions are intended to protect the monument from damage or significant alteration as set out in TAN 24: *The Historic Environment* and to ensure that details of the project are archived.
 - a) The applicant shall provide Cadw with reasonable advance notice of commencement of works on site and shall afford access at all reasonable times to any Cadw official or archaeologist nominated by Cadw to monitor progress of the works;
 - b) The approved works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the application form, plans and documents as listed below. No variations are permitted unless they have been authorised in advance, in writing by Cadw;

Number	Document / plan	Reference Number (if applicable)	Date
1	SMC application form signed by Carl Morgan and dated 27/01/2023		27/01/2023
2	Drawing 001A Proposed Works		27/01/2023

3	Copy of Cadw SM	27/01/2023
	map	
4	Copy of Cadw SM	27/01/2023
	description	
5	Heritage Impact	07/03/2023
	Statement	
6	Interpretation	10/03/2023
	panels text	
7	Revised Heritage	10/03/2023
	Impact Statement	

- c) The approved works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with a 'Method Statement' to be submitted in advance and formally approved in writing by Cadw before work commences. The 'Method Statement' shall be adhered to throughout the project and any variations shall be approved by Cadw prior to works commencing;
- d) The Method Statement shall provide for:

	INFORMATION REQUIRED	Date when information required
1	Details for location of works compound, ground preparation, removal of material at base of unauthorised path, installation of steps, concrete slabs, interpretation	Before work commences.
	panels and benches, excavation of trail holes and drilling of test holes.	
2	Arrangements for vehicle movement to minimise ground disturbance.	Before work commences.

- e) No works, including site clearance, shall commence until Cadw has been informed in writing of the name of an appropriately qualified archaeologist operating to CIfA published standards and guidance¹ who is to be present to undertake a watching brief for any works or operation occurring within the scheduled area in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, Cadw. No work shall commence until Cadw has confirmed in writing that the proposed archaeologist and archaeological works are acceptable;
- f) A digital copy of the draft watching brief report shall be submitted to Cadw for approval within 8 weeks of the archaeological fieldwork being completed²;

¹ Chartered Institute for Archaeologists https://www.archaeologists.net/codes/cifa .

² Cadw will retain a copy of the watching brief report for our records.

- g) A digital copy of the approved watching brief report shall be submitted to the regional Historic Environment Record and National Monuments Record of Wales to be incorporated into these public records³, and the applicant shall inform Cadw when this has been completed;
- h) Cadw shall be invited to attend a site meeting within the first 5 working days of commencement of the project to review the programme, submitted method statement and arrangements that have been established for archaeological mitigation/building recording;
- i) That upon completion of the project the applicant will produce a completion report including an annotated photographic record detailing the site before, during and after works took place and including final versions of plans and elevations as built. The draft should be sent to Cadw in digital format for approval within 25 working days of the works being completed; and
- j) Any historic or archaeological features not previously identified which are revealed when carrying out the works shall be retained in situ and reported to Cadw within two working days. Works shall be halted in the area/part of the site affected until provision has been made for retention and/or recording of the feature by a suitably qualified archaeologist in accordance with details submitted to and approved in writing in advance by Cadw.

2. Next Steps

5. Compliance

- 5.1. Where a condition requires approval or any contact with Cadw you are advised to contact Louise Mees by email scheduledmonuments@gov.wales.
- 5.2. When all work has been completed and the conditions have been discharged, please complete and return the 'completion notice' at **Annex B** to Cadw. Section 2(6) of the 1979 Act provides that non-compliance with a condition attached to a grant of scheduled monument consent shall be an offence.
- 5.3. By virtue of Section 4 of the 1979 Act, if no works to which this consent relates are executed or started within 5 years from the date of this letter, the consent shall cease to have effect at the end of that period (unless it is revoked in the meantime).
- 5.4. This letter does not convey any approval or consent required under any enactment, bylaw, order or regulation other than Section 2 of the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979. It is the responsibility of the applicant to obtain any such approval or consent where necessary.

6. Mechanism for Challenge

³ Cadw requires formal confirmation of report deposit to discharge condition.

- 6.1 Section 55 of the 1979 Act explains that if you are aggrieved by the decision given in this letter, you may challenge its validity by applying to the High Court within six weeks from the date of my decision. Furthermore, the legislation explains that the grounds on which an application may be made to the Court are;
 - a) that my decision is not within the powers of the Act (i.e. that I have exceeded the powers available under the Act); and
 - b) that any of the relevant requirements set out in the Act have not been complied with and that your interest has been substantially prejudiced by the failure to comply.

The 'relevant requirements' mentioned above are defined in Section 55 of the 1979 Act and it is advisable to seek legal advice before taking any action.

- 6.2. Should you have any queries please do not hesitate to contact me.
- 6.3 Finally, please note that your personal data is managed in compliance with the General Data Protection Regulations.

Yours sincerely,

Denise Harris
Casework Manager
under authority of the Deputy Minister for Arts and Sport, and Chief Whip, one of the
Welsh Ministers

ANCIENT MONUMENTS AND ARCHAEOLOGICAL AREAS ACT 1979 APPLICATION FOR SCHEDULED MONUMENT CONSENT LLANDOVERY CASTLE (CM015)

INSPECTOR'S ADVICE

1. Policy Context

- 1.1 An application for scheduled monument consent (SMC) is considered on its own merits in accordance with Conservation Principles for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment in Wales (Conservation Principles) and Annex A of Technical Advice Note 24: The Historic Environment (TAN 24). In particular, TAN 24 explains that the main purpose of scheduling is to ensure the preservation of ancient monuments and, when considering an application for SMC, there is a presumption against proposals which would involve significant alteration or cause damage, or which would have a significant impact on the setting of remains. Therefore, applicants are expected to demonstrate that no practicable alternative route or location, avoiding the scheduled area, exists and that the need to undertake works outweighs the presumption in favour of the protection of the scheduled monument.
- 1.2 The Welsh Government's six principles for sustainable management of the historic environment in Wales are also used as a guide when considering applications for scheduled monument consent. These are:
 - Historic assets will be managed to sustain their values.
 - Understanding the significance of historic assets is vital.
 - The historic environment is a shared resource.
 - Everyone will be able to participate in sustaining the historic environment.
 - Decisions about change must be reasonable, transparent and consistent.
 - Documenting and learning from decisions is essential.

2. Llandovery Castle

2.1 The monument consists of the remains of a castle, dating to the medieval period. It was originally constructed in the 12th century as a motte and bailey; the motte, a large conical mound was scarped out of a rocky hillock overlooking the Afon Bran and stands c 15m high. The bailey, a sub-rectangular embanked enclosure of c 4.5m high above the surroundings is located to the east. Further outlying banks formerly existed to the southwest. These defences will have been surrounded by wet or dry ditches and possibly strengthened with palisades, revetments, and/or a tower on top of the motte, all of wood. Later in the thirteenth century the castle was refortified in stone and the remains today

comprise the footings of a shell keep, a strong D-shaped tower on the west and a twin-towered gatehouse with a well turret to the north together with sections of a curtain wall around the motte.

The castle had an English foundation and is first mentioned in 1116 when it was attacked by Gruffudd ap Rhys. It fell briefly to the Lord Rhys in 1158 but between 1159 and 1161 was extensively repaired by Henry II. Captured again by Lord Rhys in 1162 it remained in Welsh hands for over 100 years figuring between 1195 and 1213 in a series of repeated skirmishes during the dynastic quarrels of the southern Welsh princes. In 1277 it fell to the English king Edward I and remained in English hands except for when temporarily captured by Llywelyn the Last in 1282. The repercussion of this disturbance was the fortification of the castle in stone following the grant of Cantref Bychan by Edward I to John Giffard who had assisted the king in his wars against Llywelyn.

The monument is of national importance for its potential to enhance our knowledge of medieval defensive practices. The monument is well-preserved and an important relic of the medieval landscape. It retains significant archaeological potential, with a strong probability of the presence of both structural evidence and intact associated deposits.

The scheduled area comprises the remains described and areas around them within which related evidence may be expected to survive.

2.2 The most recent Cadw visit to Llandovery Castle was undertaken on 5th October 2022, at which time the Monument at Risk level was recorded as High, due to parts of the site being overgrown with vegetation, ash die back, natural decay and visitor footfall erosion causing ground damage.

Condition trend – worsened moderate.

Current condition – unfavourable.

Vulnerability – high.

- 2.3 Carmarthenshire County Council, owners, and Llandovery Town Council, occupiers, are keen to improve the condition of and access to the site and have attended site visits and held pre-application discussions with Cadw's IAM.
- 2.4 The heritage values of the castle are summarised below:

Evidential Value:

Well preserved inner bailey and standing masonry on motte with high potential for buried archaeological remains relating to chronology, building techniques and functional detail.

Historic Value:

Demonstrating defensive arrangements of the Norman invasion and subsequent castle development.

Aesthetic Value:

Visual remains of impressive and classic medieval motte and bailey castle.

Communal Value:

Public access is provided by Carmarthenshire County Council and Llandovery Town Council who own maintain the monument. CCC and Llandovery Town Council are keen to improve the condition of the site and access in advance of the Urdd Eisteddfod, to be held in Llandovery from 29 May 2023 to 03 June 2023. The work forms part of the Ten Towns Initiative.

3. The Application

- 3.1 This application for scheduled monument consent involves (i) installation of new access steps from the bailey to the top of the motte, (ii) 3 number plastic benches to be installed on existing concrete bases, (iii) the removal of material previously eroded from an unauthorised route to the top of the motte, (iv) 2 no new interpretation panels to be installed on new 100mm deep x 900mm long x 800mm wide concrete bases (1 panel on the top of the motte and 1 panel on the NW edge of the site at car park level), and (v) limited ground investigation for potential future installation of handrail, including excavation of 6 no trial holes and drilling into bedrock.
- 3.2 27/01/2023 the applicant submitted information including an application form, Cadw SM map, Cadw SM description and drawing 001A Proposed Works. 07/03/2023 the applicant submitted the supporting Heritage Impact Statement. 10/03/2023 the applicant provided text for the information panels. A revised Heritage Impact Statement was submitted on 10/03/2023.

4. Assessment

- 4.1 Steps are proposed to enable access from the bailey to the top of the motte. The 'floating' design reduces negative impacts on the physical remains of the monument. Fixings into the ground surface will be kept to a minimum to reduce their impact. Removal of turf and topsoil will not have a negative impact on archaeological remains. A watching brief and stop clause will ensure that archaeological features exposed are recorded and protected. Prevention of further footfall erosion will improve the condition of the monument. Introduction of new materials will impact on the appearance of the monument. This slight negative impact is restricted to the route of the footpath, is not visible from all views of the monument, and will be outweighed by improving safe access to the motte.
- 4.2 3 number plastic benches to be installed on existing concrete bases. The benches replace furniture previously located at the site. Their installation will not harm historic features or deposits. Their slight visual impact will be outweighed by improving visitors' enjoyment.
- 4.3 The removal of material previously eroded from an unauthorised route to the top of the motte will be undertaken under archaeological supervision and not impact upon historic features or deposits. The likely reduction in erosion, because of discouraging visitors from using the unauthorised path, will prevent further damage to the monument and improve its appearance.
- 4.4 2 no new interpretation panels to be installed on new shallow concrete bases (panel on the top of the motte and panel on the NW edge of the site at car park level). Installation of the new panel at the top of the motte will require removal

of turf and topsoil. A watching brief and stop clause will ensure that archaeological features exposed are recorded and protected. Excavation of material to site the panel adjacent to the car park may result in revision of the proposal, which can be agreed with the IAM. This area has been much disturbed and historic features or deposits are unlikely to be damaged by installation of a concrete slab. The slabs and interpretation panels will introduce modern materials to the monument, but this negative impact will be outweighed by improved provision of information.

4.5 The proposed ground investigation for potential future installation of handrails may be resolved by observations made following removal of turf and topsoil or restricted to natural bedrock. Locations for localised works will be kept to a minimum and agreed on site by the IAM. A watching brief and stop clause will ensure that archaeological features exposed are recorded and protected.

5. Recommendation

5.1 I recommend that scheduled monument consent is granted, subject to the following conditions:

6. Proposed Conditions

- 6.1 The applicant shall provide Cadw with reasonable advance notice of commencement of works on site and will afford access at all reasonable times to any Cadw official or archaeologist nominated by Cadw to monitor progress of the works.
- 6.2 The approved works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the application form, plans and documents as listed below. No variations are permitted unless they have been authorised in advance in writing by Cadw.

Number	Document / plan	Reference Number (if applicable)	Date
1	SMC application form signed by Carl Morgan and dated 27/01/2023		27/01/2023
2	Drawing 001A Proposed Works		27/01/2023
3	Copy of Cadw SM map		27/01/2023
4	Copy of Cadw SM description		27/01/2023
5	Heritage Impact Statement		07/03/2023
6	Interpretation panels text		10/03/2023
7	Revised Heritage Impact Statement		10/03/2023

6.3 The approved works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with a 'Method Statement' to be submitted in advance and formally approved in writing by Cadw before work commences. The 'Method Statement' shall be adhered to

throughout the project and any variations shall be approved by Cadw prior to works commencing.

6.4 The Method Statement shall provide for:

	INFORMATION REQUIRED	Date when information required
1	Details for location of works compound, ground preparation, removal of material at base of unauthorised path, installation of steps, concrete slabs, interpretation panels and benches, excavation of trail holes and drilling of test holes.	Before work commences.
2	Arrangements for vehicle movement to minimise ground disturbance.	Before work commences.

- 6.5 No works, including site clearance, shall commence until Cadw has been informed in writing of the name of an appropriately qualified archaeologist operating to ClfA published standards and guidance⁴ who is to be present to undertake a watching brief for any works or operation occurring within the scheduled area in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, Cadw. No work shall commence until Cadw has confirmed in writing that the proposed archaeologist and archaeological works are acceptable.
- 6.6 A digital copy of the draft watching brief report shall be submitted to Cadw for approval within 8 weeks of the archaeological fieldwork being completed⁵.
- 6.7 A digital copy of the approved watching brief report shall be submitted to the regional Historic Environment Record and National Monuments Record of Wales to be incorporated into these public records⁶, and the applicant shall inform Cadw when this has been completed.
- 6.8 Cadw shall be invited to attend a site meeting within the first 5 working days of commencement of the project to review the programme, submitted method statement and arrangements that have been established for archaeological mitigation/building recording.
- 6.9 That upon completion of the project the applicant will produce a completion report including an annotated photographic record detailing the site before, during and after works took place and including final versions of plans and elevations as built. The draft should be sent to Cadw in digital format for approval within 25 working days of the works being completed.

⁴ Chartered Institute for Archaeologists https://www.archaeologists.net/codes/cifa .

⁵ Cadw will retain a copy of the watching brief report for our records.

⁶ Cadw requires formal confirmation of report deposit to discharge condition.

6.10 Any historic or archaeological features not previously identified which are revealed when carrying out the works shall be retained *in situ* and reported to Cadw within two working days. Works shall be halted in the area/part of the site affected until provision has been made for retention and/or recording of the feature by a suitably qualified archaeologist in accordance with details submitted to and approved in writing in advance by Cadw.

Name of Inspector: Louise Mees

Date: 12/03/2023

COMPLETION NOTICE

Name of Monument: LLANDOVERY CASTLE

Monument Number: CM015

Conditions	Date	Signature
Completion of works on site		
A digital copy of the draft watching brief report shall be submitted to Cadw for approval within 8 weeks of the archaeological fieldwork being completed		
A digital copy of the approved watching brief report shall be submitted to the regional Historic Environment Record and National Monuments Record of Wales to be incorporated into these public records ⁷ , and the applicant shall inform Cadw when this has been completed.		
That upon completion of the project the applicant will produce a completion report including an annotated photographic record detailing the site before, during and after works took place and including final versions of plans and elevations as built. The draft should be sent to Cadw in digital format for approval within 25 working days of the works being completed.		

Applicant Name:

Signature:

When all work has been completed and the conditions have been discharged, please complete and return this completion notice to Cadw at scheduledmonuments@gov.wales

⁷ Cadw requires formal confirmation of report deposit to discharge condition.